

CERTIFICATE OF MAILING

I hereby certify that I served the attached

Notice of Public Hearing Decision

regarding:

HLC 203-22 - George Robertson

On April 29, 2022, by mailing a correct copy thereof, certified by me as such, contained in a sealed envelope, with postage paid and deposited in the post office at The Dalles Oregon on said day. Between the said Post Office and the address to which said copy was mailed, there is a regular communication by US Mail.

DATED: <u>April 29, 2022</u>

aula Webbs

Secretary Community Development Department Name

HLC NOD

Jan San San San San San San San San San S	E-mail
Art Smith	arthurs@co.wasco.or.us
Bradley Cross	bradleyc@co.wasco.or.us
arolyn Wood	pcforman40@gmail.com
Cynthia Keever	ckeever@ci.the-dalles.or.us
Bale McCabe	dmccabe@ci.the-dalles.or.us
Ball Dave Anderson	danderson@ci.the-dalles.or.us
Ernie Garcia	ernie.garcia@charter.com
Entry Garcia HLC Commissioners and Reps	erne.garcia@charter.com
Jamie Carrico	JCarrico@ci.the-dalles.or.us
Jay Wood	jwood@mcfr.org
Jonathan Kara	jkara@campbellphillipslaw.com
Julie Krueger	jkrueger@ci.the-dalles.or.us
	Jkrueger@ci.tre-dailes.or.us
Nicole Bailey	nicoleba@ncphd.org
Pat Cimmiyotti	Patrick.M.Cimmiyotti@odot.state.or.us
Planning Distribution List	Patrick.m.clininiyotti@ouot.state.or.us
Richard Mays	rmays@ci.the-dalles.or.us
Sean Bailey	seanb@co.wasco.or.us
TD Disposal Service	anne.loop@wasteconnections.com
Tom Peterson	tomvpeterson@gmail.com
Tom Worthy	tworthy@ci.the-dalles.or.us
Tonya Brumley	tlb@nwnatural.com
Wasco County Assessor	assessor@co.wasco.or.us
Wasco County Planning	wcplanning@co.wasco.or.us

Kuri Gill / Ian Johnson SHPO 725 Summer St NE, Ste C Salem OR 97301

Sent via email: George Robertson - georgerobertson2011@live.com



NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING DECISION Historic Landmarks Commission 203-22 George Robertson

- **DECISION DATE:** April 29, 2022
- APPLICANT: George Robertson

REQUEST: Approval to remove non-original door and replace with siding, replace deteriorating basement windows, and add new windows on west side of home.

LOCATION: The property is located at 207 W. Fourth Street, The Dalles, Oregon, further described as 1N 13E 3 BC tax lot 1100. This property is a primary, contributing resource located in the Trevitt's Addition National Register. Property is zoned CBC – Central Business Commercial with a CBC-1 Overlay.

PROPERTY OWNER:

City of The Dalles

AUTHORITY: The Dalles Municipal Code, Chapter 11.12 Historic Resources

DECISION: Based on the findings of fact and conclusions in the staff report of HLC 203-22, and after a hearing in front of the Historic Landmarks Commission on April 27, 2022 the request by **George Robertson** is hereby **approved** with the following conditions:

- 1. Work will be completed in substantial conformance to the proposal as submitted, reviewed and approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission.
- 2. Only one additional egress window in the basement is approved with this application.
- 3. Any window that is not beyond repair shall be repaired rather than replaced.
- 4. Final paint colors on the replaced windows shall be approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission Secretary, unless the same colors are used.
- 5. If any archeological resources or materials are discovered during excavation, the applicants shall stop excavation and have the site professionally evaluated prior to continuing work.

6. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting that cause damage to historic materials, shall not be used. The surface cleaning of the structure, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

Signed this 29th day of March, 2022 by

m Marie Hot

Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner Historic Landmarks Commission Coordinator Community Development Department

APPEAL PROCESS: The Commission's approval, approval with conditions, or denial is the final decision, and <u>may be appealed to the City Council</u> if a completed Notice of Appeal is received by the City Clerk no later than 5:00 p.m. on <u>May 9, 2022</u>, the 10th day following the date of the mailing of the Notice of Decision. The following may file an appeal of decisions:

- 1. Any party of record to the particular action.
- 2. A person entitled to notice and to whom no notice was mailed. (A person to whom notice is mailed is deemed notified even if notice is not received.)
- 3. The Historic Landmarks Commission, the Planning Commission, or the City Council by majority vote.

A complete record of application is available for review upon request during regular business hours, or copies can be ordered at a reasonable price, at the City of The Dalles Community Development Department. A Notice of Appeal form is available at The Dalles Community Development Department. The fee to file a Notice of Appeal is \$500.00. The appeal process is regulated by The Dalles Municipal Code Chapter 11.12.090.



HISTORIC LANDMARKS RESOLUTION NO. 191-22

Adopting The Dalles Historic Landmarks Commission Application #203-22 of George Robertson. This application is for a Historic Landmarks Commission hearing to remove nonoriginal door and replace with siding, replace deteriorating basement windows, and add new windows on west side of home. The property is located at 207 W. Fourth Street, The Dalles, Oregon, further described as 1N 13E 3 BC tax lot 1100. The Wilkinson House, commonly known as the Vogt House, is a Queen Anne style house built in 1902. This property is a primary, contributing resource located in the Trevitt's Addition National Register. Property is zoned CBC – Central Business Commercial with a CBC-1 Overlay.

- I. RECITALS:
 - A. The Historic Landmarks Commission of the City of The Dalles has, on April 27, 2022 conducted a public hearing to consider the above request.
 - B. A Staff Report was presented, stating findings of fact and conclusions of law.
 - C. Staff Report 203-22 and the minutes of the April 27, 2022 hearing, upon approval, provide the basis for this resolution and are herein attached by reference.
- II. RESOLUTION: Now, therefore, be it FOUND, DETERMINED, and ORDERED by the Historic Landmarks Commission of the City of The Dalles as follows:
 - A. In all respects as set forth in Recitals, Part "I" of this resolution.
 - B. Historic Landmarks Review 203-22, George Robertson, is *approved* with the following conditions:
 - 1. Work will be completed in substantial conformance to the proposal as submitted, reviewed and approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission.
 - 2. Only one additional egress window in the basement is approved with this application.
 - 3. Any window that is not beyond repair shall be repaired rather than replaced.
 - 4. Final paint colors on the replaced windows shall be approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission Secretary, unless the same colors are used.
 - 5. If any archeological resources or materials are discovered during excavation, the applicants shall stop excavation and have the site professionally evaluated prior to continuing work.

- 6. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting that cause damage to historic materials, shall not be used. The surface cleaning of the structure, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
- III. APPEALS, COMPLIANCE AND PENALTIES:
 - A. Any party of record may appeal a decision of the Historic Landmarks Commission to the City Council for review. Appeals must be made in accordance to Article 11.12.090 of The Dalles Municipal Code, Chapter 11.12 Historic Resources, and must be filed with the City Clerk within ten (10) days of the date of mailing of this Order.
 - B. Failure to exercise this approval within the time line set either by Order or by The Dalles Municipal Code will invalidate this permit.

ADOPTED THIS 27TH DAY, APRIL 2022.

Robert McNary, Chair

Historic Landmarks Commission

I, Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner & Historic Landmarks Secretary for the Community Development Department of the City of the Dalles, hereby certify that the foregoing Order was adopted at the meeting of the City Historic Landmarks Commission, held on April 27, 2022.

AYES:	Eagy, McNary, Stephenson
NAYS:	None
ABSENT:	Ercole, Gleason
ABSTAIN:	None

ATTEST:

Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner & Historic Landmarks Commission Secretary City of The Dalles Community Development Department



STAFF REPORT HISTORIC LANDMARKS REVIEW #203-22

TO: The Dalles Historic Landmarks Commission

FROM: Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner Community Development Department

HEARING DATE: Wednesday, April 27, 2022

ISSUE: Request to remove and enclose non-original door on north face of home and replace with siding; replace five deteriorating basement windows; add one new egress window; and add six new basement windows.

SYNOPSIS:

51101515.	
APPLICANT	George Robertson
PROPERTY OWNER	George Robertson
LOCATION	207 W. Fourth Street,
	further described as 1N 13E 3BC tax lot 1100
ZONING	"CBC-1" – Central Business Commercial, Trevitt's
	Addition National Historic District
EXISTING USE	Residential
SURROUNDING USE	Residential and some Commercial
HISTORIC STATUS	Classified as Primary, Contributing in Trevitt's Addition
	National Historic District

NOTIFICATION: Published advertisement in local newspaper; notification to property owners within 100 feet, SHPO.

RECOMMENDATION: Approval, with conditions, based on the following findings of fact.

BACKGROUND: The historic name of this house is the Wilkinson House, commonly known as Vogt House. This Queen Anne was built in 1902 and is classified as a primary contributing resource in Trevitt's Addition National Historic District.

The applicant is proposing to remove and enclose a non-original door on north face of home and replace with siding; replace five deteriorating basement windows; add one new egress window; and add six new basement windows. The replacement and new windows are designed and built by Marvin Windows to ensure that they replicate the existing windows and are appropriate for

the historic home. The window locations are all fairly visible from Fourth Street and the rear alleyway.

ANALYSIS: The Historic Landmarks Commission is responsible for conducting hearings dealing with proposed alterations to historic buildings. The Dalles Municipal Code, Title 11 Planning, Chapter 11.12 – Historic Resources provides process as well as established design guidelines to assist the Commission in making these decisions. The purpose of the Historic Landmarks Commission, the Historic Code and the review criteria are to:

- Protect historic and cultural resources from destruction, inappropriate alteration, and incompatible adjacent development;
- Stabilize and improve property values in historic districts and citywide;
- Enhance the city's attractiveness to visitors and residents, and stimulate business, industry and tourism;
- Educate The Dalles' citizens and visitors concerning the city's heritage;
- Preserve the historic housing stock of The Dalles;
- Comply with The Dalles comprehensive Plan regarding historic resources under Statewide Planning Goal 5.

A. THE DALLES MUNICIPAL CODE – TITLE 11.12 – HISTORIC RESOURCES – CODE RELATING TO HISTORIC RESOURCES WITHIN THE CITY OF THE DALLES.

Section 11.12.070, Subsection A. Review Criteria:

3. "Secretary's Standards. Commission decisions shall be based on the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties." The following are pertinent standards from the "Guide".

1. A property shall be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

FINDING A-1: There are no plans for modifications to the existing residential use of this property. The applicant has stated they may use the basement for a bedroom which would require the added egress window. Staff is concerned that an additional six windows to the existing basement walls is more than a minimal change to the spaces and spatial relationship of this historic residence. Staff is recommending that the Commission approve only one added egress window. Criterion will be addressed as a condition of approval.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alterations to features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

FINDING A-2: The applicant is proposing to replace five existing windows that are visible from the street and are located in the basement of the residence. These windows are beyond repair and will be replaced with custom Marvin windows that are the same style and size. Criterion met.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

FINDING A-3: This property is recognized as a physical record of its time. The basement window upgrades and addition of one egress window will not create a false sense of historic development. Staff believes the additional six windows requested will not represent a physical record of the historic home's time, place and use. Staff recommends the Commission approve the replacement and/or repair of the existing basement windows and one additional egress window. Criterion will be addressed as a condition of approval.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

FINDING A-4: No such changes are proposed with this application, the applicant is requesting removal of a non-historic door on the residence. This door has not acquired historic significance. Criterion does not apply.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

FINDING A-5: Unfortunately, the existing basement windows are in poor condition and have dry rot. This proposal seeks to replace the existing windows that are beyond repair with custom Marvin windows that will match the original window size and style. No other distinctive features or finishes detailed in the inventory survey sheet are planned to be removed. Criterion met.

6. Deteriorating historical features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

FINDING A-6: This proposal seeks to replace the five existing basement windows that are beyond repair. The windows are planned to be replaced with custom designed and built Marvin windows to ensure they replicate the existing windows and are historically appropriate for the landmark. All other historic features and finishes will remain. Criterion met.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

FINDING A-7: The applicant is not proposing any chemical or physical treatments. Any planned cleaning will be required to meet the standards set forth by the Secretary of Interior. Criterion will be addressed as a condition of approval.

8. Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

FINDING A-8: Only minor excavation and ground disturbance is indicated in this application for the window wells. A condition of approval will be added to ensure any archaeological resources affected by this project follow the established federal guidelines. Criterion will be addressed as a condition of approval.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

FINDING A-9: The proposed window replacements will be a minimal modification to the historic home and allow for continued use of this landmark. However, with the exception of one new egress window, staff believes the applicant's proposal for six additional windows in the basement will not be compatible in massing, size and scale, and architectural features. In order to protect the historic integrity, staff is recommending that the Commission limit the additional windows for the basement. Criterion will be addressed as a condition of approval.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

FINDING A-10: The essential form and integrity of the structure will be protected with the basement window repairs and replacement and additional egress window. Criterion met.

B. THE DALLES MUNICIPAL CODE – TITLE 11.12.095 – HISTORIC RESOURCES – CODE RELATING TO DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR HISTORIC RESOURCES.

P. Trevitt's Addition National Historic District. (All landmarked residential structures are required to use the design guidelines established for the Trevitt's.)

6. WINDOWS AND DOORS

a. Windows and doors serve in giving character to the American house. They provide proportion and scale to the elevation. In Trevitt's Addition windows are predominantly double-hung sash. Door styles vary throughout the neighborhood. New construction and rehabilitation should try and preserve the historic character of the windows and doors through proportion, scale, and rhythm.

b. Guidelines.

- *i.* When dealing with historic windows and doors it is best to repair before replacing (see Subsection D, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation).
- *ii.* Replacement of the original windows and doors is not recommended. However, when replacement is necessary the material, size, proportion, scale, and detail of the original should be matched in order to preserve the historic integrity.
- *iii.* Original muntin configuration should be kept as it gives scale and proportion to the overall reading of the window.
- iv. If no original material exists the use of historic photographs is recommended.
- v. The use of thermal shutters and shades is recommended for weatherization as it does not affect the original windows, providing a non-impacting solution.
- vi. Interior storm windows are recommended.
- *vii. Weather stripping and caulking should be checked regularly to ensure good weatherization.*

- viii. New construction should use double-hung, one over one, or two over two windows with simple flat trim.
- ix. The use of vinyl windows is not recommended.
- x. Reflective glass is prohibited.

FINDING B-1: The applicant plans to replace the basement windows due to the level of deterioration. The proposed replacement Marvin windows will be designed and constructed with similar material and will be comparable in size, proportion, scale and details as the original. Criterion met.

CONCLUSIONS: In all respects this application meets the standards of the Secretary of the Interior and The Dalles Municipal Code, Title 11-12 Historic Resources with the following conditions:

Proposed Conditions of Approval:

- 1. Work will be completed in substantial conformance to the proposal as submitted, reviewed and approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission.
- 2. Only one additional egress window in the basement is approved with this application.
- 3. Any window that is not beyond repair shall be repaired rather than replaced.
- 4. Final paint colors on the replaced windows shall be approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission Secretary, unless the same colors are used.
- 5. If any archeological resources or materials are discovered during excavation, the applicants shall stop excavation and have the site professionally evaluated prior to continuing work.
- 6. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting that cause damage to historic materials, shall not be used. The surface cleaning of the structure, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.