



CITY of THE DALLES

313 COURT STREET
THE DALLES, OREGON 97058

(541) 296-5481 ext. 1125
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

CERTIFICATE OF MAILING

I hereby certify that I served the attached

Notice of Public Hearing Decision

regarding:

HLC 184-20 Matthieu Alirol

On January 28, 2021 by mailing a correct copy thereof, certified by me as such, contained in a sealed envelope, with postage paid and deposited on the post office at The Dalles Oregon on said day. Between the said Post Office and the address to which said copy was mailed, there is a regular communication by US Mail.

DATED: January 29, 2021

Secretary
Community Development Department

Name

HLC NOD

Name	E-mail
Arthur Smith	arthurs@co.wasco.or.us
Bradley Cross	bradleyc@co.wasco.or.us
'Brumley, Tonya'	tlb@nwnatural.com
Carolyn Wood	pcforman40@gmail.com
Cynthia Keever	ckeever@ci.the-dalles.or.us
Dale McCabe	dmccabe@ci.the-dalles.or.us
Dave Anderson	danderson@ci.the-dalles.or.us
Diana McDougale	dmcdougale@campbellphillipslaw.com
Ernie Garcia	ernie.garcia@charter.com
HLC Commissioners*	
Jamie Carrico	JCarrico@ci.the-dalles.or.us
Jay Wood	jwood@mcfrr.org
Jonathan Kara	jkara@campbellphillipslaw.com
Julie Krueger	jkrueger@ci.the-dalles.or.us
MEDIA	
Nicole Bailey	nicoleba@ncphd.org
Pat Ashmore	pashmore@ci.the-dalles.or.us
Pat Cimmiyotti	Patrick.M.Cimmiyotti@odot.state.or.us
Planning Distribution List	
Richard Mays	rmays@ci.the-dalles.or.us
TD Disposal Service	anne.loop@wasteconnections.com
Tom Peterson	tomvpeterson@gmail.com
Wasco County Assessor	assessor@co.wasco.or.us
Wasco County Planning	wcplanning@co.wasco.or.us

Kuri Gill / Ian Johnson
 SHPO
 725 Summer St NE, Ste C
 Salem, OR 97301

MATTHIEU ALIROL
 515 W 3RD PL
 THE DALLES OR 97058



CITY of THE DALLES

313 COURT STREET
THE DALLES, OREGON 97058

(541) 296-5481 ext. 1125
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING DECISION Historic Landmarks Commission 184-20 Matthieu Alirol

DECISION DATE: January 27, 2021

APPLICANT: Matthieu Alirol

REQUEST: The applicant requested approval to site and construct a detached garage at rear of property.

LOCATION: The property is located at 515 W. Third Place, The Dalles, Oregon and is further described as 1N 13E 4 AA tax lot 1700. The Donnell House is a Shingle Style/Vernacular House built c.1905/c. 1927 and is a Secondary Contributing resource in Trevitt's National Historic District.

PROPERTY OWNER: Matthieu Alirol

AUTHORITY: The Dalles Municipal Code, Chapter 11.12 Historic Resources

DECISION: Based on the findings of fact and conclusions in the staff report of HLC 184-20, and after a hearing in front of the Historic Landmarks Commission on January 27, 2021, the request by **Matthieu Alirol** to site and construct a detached garage is hereby **approved** with the following conditions:

Work shall be completed in substantial conformance to the pictures and proposals as submitted, reviewed and modified.

1. Work will be completed in substantial conformance to the pictures and proposals as submitted and reviewed.
2. If any archeological resources or materials are discovered during excavation, the applicants shall stop excavation and have the site professionally evaluated prior to continuing work.
3. The applicant shall complete the building permit process with the City and upon approval, complete the permitting process with the local Building Codes Department.

Signed this 27th day of January, 2021 by



Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner
Historic Landmarks Commission Coordinator
Community Development Department

APPEAL PROCESS: The Commission's approval, approval with conditions, or denial is the final decision, and may be appealed to the City Council if a completed Notice of Appeal is received by the City Clerk no later than 5:00 p.m. on the 10th day following the date of the mailing of the Notice of Decision. The following may file an appeal of decisions:

1. Any party of record to the particular action.
2. A person entitled to notice and to whom no notice was mailed. (A person to whom notice is mailed is deemed notified even if notice is not received.)
3. The Historic Landmarks Commission, the Planning Commission, or the City Council by majority vote.

A complete record of application is available for review upon request during regular business hours, or copies can be ordered at a reasonable price, at the City of The Dalles Community Development Department. A Notice of Appeal form is available at The Dalles Community Development Department. The fee to file a Notice of Appeal is \$500.00. **The appeal process is regulated by The Dalles Municipal Code Chapter 11.12.090.**



CITY of THE DALLES

313 COURT STREET
THE DALLES, OREGON 97058

(541) 296-5481 ext. 1125
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

HISTORIC LANDMARKS RESOLUTION NO. 173-21

Adopting The Dalles Historic Landmarks Commission Application #184-20 of Matthieu Alirol.

This application is for a Historic Landmarks Commission hearing to gain approval to site and construct a detached garage at rear of the property. The property is located at 515 W. Third Place, The Dalles, Oregon and is further described as 1N 13E 4 AA tax lot 1700. The Donnell House is a Shingle Style/Vernacular House built c.1905/c. 1927 and is a Secondary Contributing resource in Trevitt's National Historic District. Property is zoned High Density Residential (RH) with a Central Business Commercial, Sub-district CBC-1 Overlay.

I. RECITALS:

- A. The Historic Landmarks Commission of the City of The Dalles has, on January 27, 2021 conducted a public hearing to consider the above request.
- B. A Staff Report was presented, stating findings of fact and conclusions of law.
- C. Staff Report 184-20 and the minutes of the January 27, 2021 hearing, upon approval, provide the basis for this resolution and are herein attached by reference.

II. RESOLUTION: Now, therefore, be it FOUND, DETERMINED, and ORDERED by the Historic Landmarks Commission of the City of The Dalles as follows:

- A. In all respects as set forth in Recitals, Part "I" of this resolution.
- B. Historic Landmarks Review 184-20, Matthieu Alirol, is ***approved*** with the following conditions:
 - 1. Work will be completed in substantial conformance to the pictures and proposals as submitted and reviewed.
 - 2. If any archeological resources or materials are discovered during excavation, the applicants shall stop excavation and have the site professionally evaluated prior to continuing work.
 - 3. The applicant shall complete the building permit process with the City and upon approval, complete the permitting process with the local Building Codes Department.

III. APPEALS, COMPLIANCE AND PENALTIES:

- A. Any party of record may appeal a decision of the Historic Landmarks Commission to the City Council for review. Appeals must be made in accordance to Article 11.12.090

of The Dalles Municipal Code, Chapter 11.12 Historic Resources, and must be filed with the City Clerk within ten (10) days of the date of mailing of this Order.

- B. Failure to exercise this approval within the time line set either by Order or by The Dalles Municipal Code will invalidate this permit.

ADOPTED THIS 27TH DAY, JANUARY, 2021.


Robert McNary, Chair
Historic Landmarks Commission

I, Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner & Historic Landmarks Secretary for the Community Development Department of the City of the Dalles, hereby certify that the foregoing Order was adopted at the meeting of the City Historic Landmarks Commission, held on January 27, 2021.

AYES: Eagy, Ercole, Leash, McNary

NAYS: _____

ABSENT: _____

ABSTAIN: Gleason


ATTEST: _____
Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner & Historic Landmarks Commission Secretary
City of The Dalles Community Development Department



STAFF REPORT HISTORIC LANDMARKS REVIEW #184-20

TO: The Dalles Historic Landmarks Commission

FROM: Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner

HEARING DATE: January 27, 2021

ISSUE: The property owner is requesting approval to site and construct a new garage to the rear of the historic Donnell House.

SYNOPSIS:

APPLICANT	Matthieu Alirol
PROPERTY OWNER	Same
LOCATION	515 West Third Place, The Dalles, OR 97058
ZONING	"RH" – Residential High Density
EXISTING USE	Residential
SURROUNDING USE	Primarily Residential
HISTORIC STATUS	Secondary Contributing in Trevitt's National Historic District

NOTIFICATION: Published advertisement in local newspaper; notification to property owners within 100 feet and the Oregon State Historic Preservation Office.

RECOMMENDATION: Approval, with conditions, based on the following findings of fact.

BACKGROUND: The Donnell House was built circa 1905 and remodeled extensively in circa 1927 with elements of the Shingle Style/Vernacular. The property is located in the Trevitt's National Historic District and is classified as Secondary, Contributing.

In 2008, the applicant purchased the house with plans of restoration. During their interior restoration project, they found the picture windows installed circa 1927 were obviously not original. The applicant replaced the unrepairable windows, repaired the deteriorating porches and painted the home. Prior to completion of their restoration project the house had a fire with extensive damage. The homeowners repaired as much of the original materials as possible.

This request is to site and construct a new three-car garage that will be accessed from the rear of the property. No alterations are planned to the historic house or the front and side yards fronting on West 3rd Place. The garage is planned to be 40 feet wide by 34 feet deep, with three garage door openings and a loft bonus room, 30± feet by 19± feet, which will be accessed via an exterior stairway. The materials used for the garage will include lap siding, shingles, and a window similar in style to the main residence.

The west elevation will include a man door to the garage and a man-door, window and staircase for the loft bonus room. The north elevation will face the rear access to the property and will be set back 29 feet from the edge of the Mill Creek bank and over 50 feet from the rear property line.

ANALYSIS: The Historic Landmarks Commission is responsible for conducting hearings dealing with proposed alterations to historic buildings. The Dalles Municipal Code, Title 11 Planning, Chapter 11.12 – Historic Resources provides process as well as established design guidelines to assist the Commission in making these decisions. The purpose of the Historic Landmarks Commission, the Historic Code and the review criteria are to:

- *Protect historic and cultural resources from destruction, inappropriate alteration, and incompatible adjacent development;*
- *Stabilize and improve property values in historic districts and citywide;*
- *Enhance the city's attractiveness to visitors and residents, and stimulate business, industry and tourism;*
- *Educate The Dalles' citizens and visitors concerning the city's heritage;*
- *Preserve the historic housing stock of The Dalles;*
- *Comply with The Dalles Comprehensive Plan.*

A. THE DALLEs MUNICIPAL CODE – TITLE 11.12 – HISTORIC RESOURCES – CODE RELATING TO HISTORIC RESOURCES WITHIN THE CITY OF THE DALLEs.

Section 11.12.070, Subsection A. Review Criteria:

3. "Secretary's Standards. Commission decisions shall be based on the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties." The following are pertinent standards from the "Guide".

1. *"A property shall be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships."*

FINDING A-1: The property with the existing home was constructed as a residence in circa 1905 and has continued to be used as a residence over the years. Criterion met.

2. *"The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alterations to features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided."*

FINDING A-2: The request does not include removing any historic materials from the site or historic home. Criterion met.

3. *“Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.”*

FINDING A-3: There are no plans for additions that would create a false sense of historical development. This new garage will be built to complement the existing house and use similar materials. There are no plans to add conjectural features or architectural elements that are incompatible with the style of the house. Criterion met.

4. *“Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.”*

FINDING A-4: No known changes are planned for removal. Criterion does not apply.

5. *“Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.”*

FINDING A-5: There are no plans for removal of any historic features. Criterion does not apply.

6. *“Deteriorating historical features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.”*

FINDING A-6: The applicant does not plan to alter any historic features to the historic home. Criterion does not apply.

7. *“Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.”*

FINDING A-7: There are no plans for any surface cleaning of the existing historic home. Criterion does not apply.

8. *“Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.”*

FINDING A-8: Only minor ground disturbance is planned for the installation of the driveway and fencing. Criterion will be addressed as a condition of approval.

9. *“New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.”*

FINDING A-9: The applicant is proposing to site and construct a new garage to the rear of the property. The proposed garage will not be physically connected to the historic house. The structure is proposed to be compatible in size and scale and will be differentiated from the circa 1905/1927 house. The applicant has provided renderings that indicate a complimentary style to the primary house.

The garage will be accessed to the rear of the property. No modifications will be made to the front yard; the garage will be minimally visible from W. 3rd Place. Criterion met.

10. "New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."

FINDING A-10: The new garage will not be connected to the house and will be located to the rear of the property. No modifications are planned to the historic structure. The garage will be constructed using the natural slope of the land; if removed in the future, the essential integrity of the historic property will be easily returned to its current state. Criterion met.

B. THE DALLES MUNICIPAL CODE – TITLE 11.12.095 – HISTORIC RESOURCES – CODE RELATING TO DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR HISTORIC RESOURCES.

P. Trevitt's Addition

4. ROOFING

- a. Roof forms contribute to the character of Trevitt's Addition in their form. They are predominantly gables with an assortment of gambrels and hips. New construction and rehabilitation should maintain the residential nature of the roof forms of the historic neighborhood.*
- b. Guidelines.*
 - i. Wherever possible preserve, repair and protect existing materials and forms (see Subsection D, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation).*
 - ii. New construction should use roof forms that are consistent with the residential buildings in the neighborhood.*
 - iii. Gable, hip, and gambrel roof forms are recommended.*
 - iv. Flat roof forms for new construction are not recommended and are usually associated with commercial buildings.*
 - v. Both new construction and rehabilitation should use wood or asphalt shingles.*
 - vi. Metal roofing and wood shakes are not recommended, unless original (St. Peter's Catholic Church).*
 - vii. If replacement or repair is necessary, retain a portion of original roofing for future information.*
 - viii. The use of historic photographs for reference is recommended.*

FINDING B-1: The applicant is proposing the garage be complimentary to the historic home. The applicants plan to construct the garage with a gable roof form with asphalt roofing materials. Criterion met.

5. SIDING

a. The sense of cohesiveness and continuity of Trevitt's Addition derives in part from the consistent use of building materials in building facades: horizontal wood siding, brick, and stucco. New construction and rehabilitation should use materials that provide scale and relate to the historic residential character.

b. Guidelines.

- i. Wherever possible preserve, repair and protect existing materials (see Subsection D, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation).*
- ii. If necessary, siding should be replaced with in-kind materials (see Subsection D, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation).*
- iii. The use of materials appropriate to the building style is recommended.*
- iv. Be consistent with the original siding in terms of style and exposure.*
- v. When replacing shingle siding it is recommended to use shingles with the same texture, exposure, pattern and to install with the same construction technique.*
- vi. In general all buildings should have wood siding that is painted.*
- vii. For new construction the use of stucco, brick and wood siding is recommended.*
- viii. The use of aluminum, vinyl and plywood siding is prohibited.*

FINDING B-2: The applicant is proposing the garage be constructed of wood materials, lap siding, and painted to match the historic home. Criterion met.

6. WINDOWS AND DOORS

a. Windows and doors serve in giving character to the American house. They provide proportion and scale to the elevation. In Trevitt's Addition windows are predominantly double-hung sash. Door styles vary throughout the neighborhood. New construction and rehabilitation should try and preserve the historic character of the windows and doors through proportion, scale, and rhythm.

b. Guidelines.

- i. When dealing with historic windows and doors it is best to repair before replacing (see Subsection D, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation).*
- ii. Replacement of the original windows and doors is not recommended. However, when replacement is necessary the material, size, proportion, scale, and detail of the original should be matched in order to preserve the historic integrity.*
- iii. Original muntin configuration should be kept as it gives scale and proportion to the overall reading of the window.*
- iv. If no original material exists the use of historic photographs is recommended.*
- v. The use of thermal shutters and shades is recommended for weatherization as it does not affect the original windows, providing a non-impacting solution.*
- vi. Interior storm windows are recommended.*

- vii. *Weather stripping and caulking should be checked regularly to ensure good weatherization.*
- viii. *New construction should use double-hung, one over one, or two over two windows with simple flat trim.*
- ix. *The use of vinyl windows is not recommended.*
- x. *Reflective glass is prohibited.*

FINDING B-3: The applicant plans to construct the garage with the same windows used on the primary house, which will be primary wood materials. The windows are proposed to have muntin (grids) that follow the design of the house. The doors are also planned to have windows with muntin to match the windows. Criterion met.

7. **COLOR**

- a. *Trevitt's Addition has a varied range of building colors which contributes to the liveliness of the neighborhood. New paint should maintain an overall image of variety, without providing a strict palette, allowing for flexibility and freedom, which created the current appearance of the neighborhood.*
- b. *Guidelines.*
 - i. *Research and replication of original paint colors is recommended.*
 - ii. *As a rule it is recommended that three colors be used:*
darkest-window sash
medium-building
lightest-trim, detail
 - iii. *In choosing a color scheme for a house, consult the local hardware stores which have historic paint palettes for suggested styles.*
 - iv. *In general earth tones are recommended.*
 - v. *Lighter colors used for smaller homes help to give them more presence.*
 - vi. *Houses should use varying color palettes in an effort to retain the sense of variety in the neighborhood.*

FINDING B-4: The applicant is proposing the garage be painted to match the historic house, which is a grey tone with white trim. There is no third color with the existing house. Criterion met.

CONCLUSIONS: The proposed garage improvement will be within the historic design guidelines. The addition of the new garage will have very minimal impact to the existing street façade as it is located/accessed to the rear of the property. These changes to the site will allow the applicant to provide enclosed parking and encourage the continued use of this residential historic landmark, while affording the applicant a current day accessory building type. In all respects this application meets the standards of the Secretary of the Interior and The Dalles Municipal Code, Title 11.12 Historic Resources with the following conditions:

Recommended Conditions of Approval:

- 1. Work will be completed in substantial conformance to the pictures and proposals as submitted and reviewed.

2. If any archeological resources or materials are discovered during excavation, the applicants shall stop excavation and have the site professionally evaluated prior to continuing work.
3. The applicant shall complete the building permit process with the City and upon approval, complete the permitting process with the local Building Codes Department.