

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

November 20, 2013

City Hall Council Chambers
313 Court Street
The Dalles, OR 97058
Conducted in a handicap accessible room.
4:00 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER

Acting Chair McNary called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

The following Commissioners were present:

Eric Gleason
Robert McNary
Pat Smith
Dennis Davis
Dixie Parker

Others present:

Councilor at Large Carolyn Wood

Staff present:

City Attorney Gene Parker
Senior Planner Dawn Marie Hert
Administrative Secretary Carole Trautman

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

It was moved by Parker and seconded by Davis to approve the agenda as submitted. The motion carried unanimously.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

It was moved by Parker and seconded by Davis to approve the October 23, 2013 minutes as submitted. Parker, Davis and McNary were in favor; Smith and Gleason abstained; the motion carried.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Trish Neal, PO Box 1571, The Dalles, Oregon, reported that the state approved the Anderson roofing grant totaling \$6,300.

PUBLIC HEARING (Continuance)

Historic Landmarks Commission Application #141-13 - The United Church of Christ Congregational; Request to gain approval to replace 25 windows in the historic portion of the structure. The property is located at 111 East Fifth Street, The Dalles, Oregon, and is further described as 1N 13E 3BC t.l. 5700. Property is zoned "CBC" – Central Business Commercial. The historic names of this structure are Congregational United Church and First Congregational Church. The

historic structure was built in 1936 and is classified as Secondary in The Dalles Commercial Historic District.

Vice Chair McNary read the rules for a public hearing and asked if anyone had any ex parte contract, conflict of interest, or bias that would hinder them from making an impartial decision. Commissioner Parker stated she served on the church's council and excused herself from the hearing.

Chair Gleason stated he and his wife, Jacqueline, met with the church pastor and looked at the windows. City Attorney Parker asked Gleason if any portion of the tour would hinder him from making an impartial decision. Gleason said he tried to assess the condition of the windows and he did not believe it would hinder his decision.

Senior Planner Hert presented the staff report. Hert indicated that staff chose to take a more neutral stance on a recommendation to allow the Commission to determine if criteria had been met. The applicant requested Marvin Tilt Sash window replacements and some repairs to the existing window encasements. Steel windows would be replaced with vinyl windows. Hert emphasized that the Commission would need to review and decide on Finding A-5 regarding the preservation of distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques.

McNary questioned whether the Commission could determine whether or not the windows were repairable. Hert said Joy Sears of the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) advised there is a list of historic contractors, and any contractor that requests historic contractor status can state he/she is put on the list. Sears said the best way to determine window repair was to start by assuming every window could be repaired. Sears looked at the submitted window pictures and said they could be repaired. McNary said he had a difficult time second guessing the applicant's contractor's opinion. Gleason asked if a contractor with no restoration experience should be hired for historic buildings. McNary said if the applicant had confidence in the contractor, then he felt he should give them the benefit of the doubt and not question the contractor's expertise.

Chair Gleason opened the public hearing at 4:23 p.m.

Testimony

Proponents

Nikki Lesich, PO Box 643, The Dalles, Oregon, thanked the Commission for considering the application. Ms. Lesich gave a brief explanation on the steps taken for the Urban Renewal Agency (URA) grant process that UCCC had completed. She said UCCC would be open to the Commission's and SHPO's concerns and advice.

Lyle Miller, 2236 West 14th Street, The Dalles, Oregon, spoke on the current conditions of the existing windows. Dust blows through them, and many have broken ropes. Gleason asked if the windows were beyond repair. Mr. Miller said he could not answer that question. Gleason asked if the proposed replacement windows would have true divided lights. Miller said most of the windows had grids on the top part. Gleason said one of the standards called for "like kind" replacements.

McNary asked Mr. Miller if the existing windows were all going to be replaced. Mr. Miller said that as far as he knew, they would all be replaced. Senior Planner Hert commented that on the old portion of the building, some of the encasements would be repaired. The sills and sashes would remain for the historic portion of the building.

Pastor Deborah Allen, 1809 Montana Street, The Dalles, Oregon, stated UCCC took the significant historical value of their building seriously. The building is used for service to the community events such as non-profit groups, book groups, etc. Pastor Allen said that, in order to maintain the ministry of the building, the church needed to have energy-efficient heating remedies that would make heating affordable.

Dixie Parker, 2445 East 15th Street, The Dalles, Oregon, stated that the building is often open and viewed for historic events.

Opponents

Jacqueline Cheung, 704 Case Street, The Dalles, Oregon, stated she and Chair Gleason visited the church and asked to view the windows. She had a concern that there had not been a condition assessment of the windows. Dixie Parker stated what UCCC members noticed was that wind and sand came through the windows. Ms. Cheung commented that perhaps the interior storm windows could be effective. Ms. Parker said the interior storm windows were left in year round, and the room with storm windows was left unused. The exterior windows could not be opened, and the room got very hot in the summer. Ms. Cheung said she would suggest the grant money be used for repair rather than replacement. She thought repair would be a lot less expensive.

Rebuttal

Nikki Lesich, PO Box 643, The Dalles, Oregon, stated UCCC was seeking assistance because the windows had not been repaired for a long time, and the church wanted to be proactive to preserve the condition of the building.

Chair Gleason closed the hearing at 4:43 p.m.

Deliberation

Chair Gleason commented that there were two options: repair or replace the windows. He felt the applicants had not explored the option of repairing the windows. Gleason said some of the problems of wind and sand could possibly be resolved with weather stripping, and he briefly explained the process. Smith asked if just the windows could be replaced. Gleason said that was an option that could be explored. He stated that the Secretary of State's criterion numbers 2 and 6 spoke to the fact that the original windows should be preserved and repaired. The advantages would be that the windows could be saved, and the church could save money by repairing rather than replacing. Chair Gleason asked to continue the hearing, and he would be willing to work with the church to explore alternatives.

Wood asked if the steel windows could be divided into two so that part of them could be done soon and the other part could not. Gleason said he preferred to look at it holistically, but there was not much information on steel windows. He said he would be willing to provide the written material to the applicant. Davis asked him if he knew of anyone who had done this kind of work. Gleason said he

had written material that said steel windows could be repaired, but no information on how to do it. McNary said he found it difficult to ask the applicant to do something different as long as the SHPO requirements had been met. Gleason questioned if the work presented met the criteria. Davis said he would like to see a review done by an historic contractor, however, he did not know if a repair would be as energy efficient.

McNary asked staff if it was appropriate for the Commission to direct the applicant on how to do the work. Senior Planner Hert said the Commission could approve with conditions. The applicant could appeal any condition to the City Council and request a condition change. The applicant could also re-apply for the grant in six months, Hert said. Gleason suggested continuing the hearing.

It was moved by Davis and seconded by Smith to re-open the hearing. The motion carried unanimously.

McNary asked the applicant representative if this was acceptable. Pastor Deborah Allen, 1809 Montana Avenue, The Dalles, Oregon, said it would have to be acceptable. She said the difference between window repair at the Fort Dalles Museum and the church was that the church was a living building, so the criteria was different. Pastor Allen reiterated staff's comment that finding a qualified contractor was difficult, and UCCC had previously attempted that. However, UCCC would proceed as directed.

Dixie Parker, 2445 East 15th Street, The Dalles, Oregon, asked if grant funds could be used to pay for a professional assessment. City Attorney Parker did not believe grant funds could be used in that manner. Senior Planner Hert said most contractors would give a free estimate, and Chair Gleason said the expert window repair contractor gave Fort Dalles Museum a free estimate. Ms. Parker said it appeared as if an analysis would be needed because of energy efficiency. Pastor Allen asked if they could be provided a list on what kind of information the Commission would like to have provided for the next hearing.

It was moved by Davis and seconded by Smith to continue the public hearing to the January 22, 2014 meeting to receive further information on restoration of the existing windows. The motion carried unanimously.

PIONEER CEMETERY

Senior Planner Hert reported that some tombstones, and portions of tombstones, were discovered in the Portland area. After speaking with The Dalles Police Department, it was determined they were probably from the Dufur cemetery.

Chair Gleason advised that SHPO had some grant funds available. Sallie Donovan said she would be willing to do some more work. Hert said she would check to see if there were any matching funds for that.

It was the general consensus of the Commission that the cemetery looked good.

COMMISSIONER/STAFF COMMENTS

Senior Planner Hert reported the City received the Certified Local Government grant. Hert will assess HLC goals and determine what funds were available and what projects would qualify. Her thought was to continue on with directional signs, but SHPO indicated they would not consider granting for additional signs. The local Main Street Program may possibly work on a façade improvements grant.

Senior Planner Hert reported that Portland Community College was considering an architectural restoration project within the historic district.

Regarding the historic street sign McNary reported on at the last meeting, it appeared to be four sided and located on the northeast corner of 13th Street and Laughlin in someone's landscaping, Hert said. Councilor Wood said it could be a state highway mile marker or a marker from the east side of town.

Senior Planner Hert said Joy Sears would like to come to the City and teach a class on historic window restoration. Perhaps this could be coupled with the Main Street efforts. Parker said contractors needed to attend such classes. Parker asked staff who UCCC should contact to obtain window repair information. Gleason said he would help with that. He attended a window repair workshop sponsored by Clatsop Community College that now has an historic preservation program. Ms. Parker said she was concerned about losing the URA grant if the requirements changed. Hert said that, in talking with Dan Durow, if the grant needed to be modified, it could. Discussion followed regarding training some local contractors in historic preservation.

Senior Planner Hert reported she would be sending a letter to the property owner of the fire damaged Pentland house, located in Trevitts National Historic District, outlining his options.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 5:55 PM.

The next meeting is scheduled for January 22, 2014 at 4:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted by Carole Trautman, Administrative Secretary.



Eric Gleason, Chair
Historic Landmarks Commission