

#### CITY of THE DALLES 313 COURT STREET THE DALLES, OREGON 97058

(541) 296-5481 ext. 1125 PLANNING DEPARTMENT

## SPECIAL MEETING AGENDA CITY OF THE DALLES HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBERS

313 COURT STREET THE DALLES, OREGON 97058 MEETING CONDUCTED IN A ROOM IN COMPLIANCE WITH ADA STANDARDS

> Wednesday, August 2, 2017 4:00 PM

- I. Call to Order
- II. Roll Call
- III. Pledge of Allegiance
- IV. Approval of Agenda
- V. Approval of Minutes May 24, 2017
- VI. Public Comments During this portion of the meeting, anyone may speak on any subject which does not later appear on the agenda. Five minutes per person will be allowed.

## VII. Public Hearing

Historic Landmarks Commission Application #156-17; MAB RMB, LLC (Bustos Construction); Request: Make exterior modifications to the historic Sinnott House that include: replacement of siding comprised of varying styles and materials, restoration of the remaining historic windows, replacement of aluminum non-historic windows with period appropriate windows, and re-painting the house in a historic palette.

## VIII. Resolution: 146-17 for HLC #156-17; MAB RMB, LLC (Bustos Construction)

- IX. Staff/Commissioner Comments
- X. Next Meeting Date August 23, 2017
- XI. Adjournment



#### CITY of THE DALLES 313 COURT STREET

THE DALLES, OREGON 97058

(541) 296-5481 ext. 1125 Planning Department

## MINUTES CITY OF THE DALLES HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBERS 313 COURT STREET THE DALLES, OREGON 97058 CONDUCTED IN A HANDICAP ACCESSIBLE MEETING ROOM

# Wednesday, May 24, 2017

4:00 PM

## I. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Commissioner McNary at 4:00 p.m.

### II. Roll Call

Sandra Bisset, Dennis Davis, Robert McNary, Doug Leash
Eric Gleason
Ft. Dalles Museum Representative Heather Kirby, City Councilor
Tim McGlothlin (arrived at 4:10 p.m.)
Senior Planner Dawn Hert, Assistant to the City Manager
Matthew Klebes

#### II. Pledge of Allegiance

Vice Chair McNary led the Pledge of Allegiance.

## IV. Approval of Agenda

Senior Planner Hert requested an amendment to the agenda to include a presentation by Dr. Bob Hadlow, Historian, Oregon Department of Transportation (ODOT). Commissioner Leash moved to approve the agenda as amended, Commissioner Bisset seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

#### V. Approval of Minutes – March 22, 2017

Commissioner Bisset moved to approve the minutes March 22, 2017 minutes as written; Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

#### VI. Public Comments

None.

#### VII. Presentation

Brad DeHart, Engineer, ODOT District 9, Region 4, introduced Dr. Bob Hadlow, Senior Historian, ODOT. Dr. Hadlow presented an overview on the US 30 Mosier, Dry Canyon and Chenoweth Creek Bridges Project with primary focus on the restoration planned for Chenoweth Creek Bridge. The bridge restoration will retain the original features while meeting current safety standards.

#### VIII. Pioneer Cemetery Discussion

Senior Planner Hert stated Pioneer Cemetery had been cleaned up by the National Guard; wildflowers were left in place. The City Maintenance crew hauled away the debris. A suggestion was made that the City newsletter include an update on the Pioneer Cemetery.

Assistant to the City Manager Matthew Klebes provided an update on the grant application to develop an interactive web page of Pioneer Cemetery. If successful, the grant would be funded through the State Historic Preservation Office. Also included in the grant application were monies for headstone restoration work. A decision is scheduled for June 5, 2017.

Bisset shared the latest version of the Pioneer Cemetery map owned by the Genealogy Society. Bisset stated there is a sequential history of Pioneer Cemetery; more information is available.

McNary asked if the City secured a Memorandum of Understanding with the National Guard. Hert replied an informal agreement was in place.

### VIII. Staff/Commissioner Comments

McNary asked about progress on the Granada. Hert replied the bulk of the work at this time is interior. Gomez made contact with David Benko regarding marquee restoration.

McNary inquired about responsibility for Rock Fort. Hert replied general maintenance will be handled by the City.

Hert stated that staff had approved painting of Pawsh Spa, located at 204 E. Second Street, using the historic building color guidelines.

Hert also stated the Lemke Building façade improvement was in progress.

Klebes shared concerns raised about the Gitchell Building. Klebes compiled an agenda staff report summarizing the history and providing four options for the building:

- Preservation of the building as a landmark in its' current location "as is" with no intention of using the interior
- Preservation and restoration of the building
- Pursue a Request for Qualifications (RFQ)
- Demolition

City Council decided to proceed with the development of an RFQ. An RFQ would potentially provide alternatives to demolition while addressing issues such as the building's proximity to the railroad. The RFQ would remain open for six months to one year.

Bisset asked if the historic significance of the Gitchell Building would be a component of the RFQ. Klebes replied RFQ components would include the engineering and geological studies completed on the building, the registry of the building within an historic area, and a general overview of the history of the building. Hert stated any modifications, relocations or demolition would be presented to the Historic Landmarks Commission prior to a decision.

McGlothlin stated he was working on establishing exactly when the building was commissioned by Abraham Lincoln as a post office. McGlothlin received additional direction from the Library of Congress on avenues to explore while researching the building. He said a historical component is necessary when deciding the future of the building. The current location poses an access problem.

Leash said he hoped for continued discussions on the Gitchell Building along with an outline of progress. Klebes replied he was currently drafting the RFQ; when complete, the RFQ will be forwarded to the Commission. Klebes said his Staff Report was part of the City Council agenda, and he would share that as well.

Davis suggested the Commission read the report on the physical examination of the building. Klebes replied he would forward the report.

Kirby stated the Fort Dalles Museum was considering options for exterior preservation.

#### IX. Next Meeting Date

At the time of this meeting, there were no agenda items for the June 28, 2017 meeting. The next scheduled meeting is July 26, 2017.

### X. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:29 p.m. by Vice Chair McNary.

Respectfully Submitted Paula Webb, Planning Secretary

Bob McNary, Vice Chair Historic Landmark Commission



CITY of THE DALLES 313 COURT STREET THE DALLES, OREGON 97058

(541) 296-5481 ext. 1125 FAX: (541) 298-5490 Community Development Dept.

HLC# 56-17

# HISTORICAL LANDMARKS APPLICATION

Application is required for modifications and/or alterations to the exterior of certified historic structures and all structures within certified historic districts. Additionally, new construction within established historic districts are also required to appear before the City of The Dalles Historic Landmarks Commission.

Mamai	magama 110	PI			
Name:	MABRMB, LLC				
Address	2232 W. 10Th St. The Dalles, or 97058	V			
Site Address	316 W. 4 Th St. The Dalles, or 97058				
Map and					
Tax Lot	TAX LOT 4600				
Telephone	541-298-5398				
Zoning					
Please describ	be your project goals.				
REMODE	el And restore, Install hardi-cement board	instead			
of wood.					

How will your project affect the appearance of the building and or site?

will a fect the appearance very little -SAISP ChWARK Sidinds MANV WORD, SIZES

What efforts are being made to maintain the historic character of this structure? We are trying to restore it to gits origina form within leason.

What is the current use of this property?

Residential home Will the use change as a result of approval of this application?

Yes/No

List any known archeological resources on site.

The review criteria for each application are the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. These standards have been adopted by City Ordinance 94-1194 as local review criteria.

I certify that the above information is correct and submit this application with nine (9) copies of a site plan drawn to scale, nine (9) copies of detailed, elevation drawings with proposed changes, and nine (9) current color photographs (4X6 inch minimum) of the building/structure front.

MABRMB, LLC Roxann Bustos

Applicant

<u>7-14-17</u> Date

Harn Busto

Owner (if not the applicant)

I have reviewed the above application and certify that it is complete and accepted for processing.

Secretary, Historical Landmarks Commission

# For Office Use Only

Historical Classification(Pri	mary, Secondary, Historical, Etc.)
Historic Building/Site 🗆 🔪	Historic District: Trevitt 🗆 Commercial 🗆
(If any)	
Year(s) Built	











(/the-real-estate-group/)

Back to Search (/the-real-estate-group/listing/listingsearch.aspx)

# 316 W 4TH St, The Dalles OR, 97058

e ela i neel	4/21/2017	3 beds, 2 Full baths	Status: Sold
	-\$25,000	1,640 sqft	MLS#: 17660446

Calculate Payment

2 of 17



























# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Drew sold the street right of way directly to the east of Lot 1 in Block 4 to E. M. Wingate for \$250 (Book F12). And the 1878 tax assessment for E. M. Wingate show this property valued at \$900 and household furnishings valued at \$300. On Stope 6, 1935, Edward M. Wingate transferred the whership to his wife, Grace Wingate (Book 86:213 & 274). Auxiliary Building: None Owner: D. & Mida K. Mitchell #43 locant Lot c/o D.C. & Jennifer Garner Address: Historic Name: 316 West 4th St. The Dalles, OR 97058 Common Name: NA NT SOL Year Built: NA Map No: 1N 13 3BC Reference No: 3513 Plat: Trevitt's Addition Block: 4 Lot: S of 3 & part of 4 Architect: NA Style: NA Use: cant Alterations: NA Vacant Tax Lot: 4300 #44 Address: Vacant Lot Historic Name: PO Box L Winlock, WA 98596 Common Name: NA Map No: 1N 13 3BB Reference No: 3514 Plat: Travitt's Addition Block: 4 Lot: N of 3 & part of 4 Lot: 4700 Year Built: Architect Style: NA Use: Vacant Alterations: NA Vacant Address: 316 West Fourth Street #45 Owner: Kenneth & Mida K. Mitchell %Douglas & Jennifer Garner Historic Name: Craig House 316 W. Fourth Street Common Name: Sinnott House Year Built: c. 1870/c.1902 The Dalles, OR 97058 Architect: Unknown Map No: 1N 13 3BB Reference No: 3515 Style: Vernacular/Eastlake Plat: Trevitt's Addition Use: Residential Alterations: Minor Block: 4 Lot: 4, 5 & 6 Primary/Contributing Tax Lot: 4600

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 7 Page 72

Description: The one and one-half story building is rectangular in plan and has an intersecting gable roof. The roof is sheathed with composition shingles. The building has boxed overhanging eaves and a wide friezeboard. The front porch and upper deck extends across the front elevation. The porch is decorated with turned posts with brackets, wide friezeboard, and stick balustrade. The upper deck has a low balustrade with square newels capped with finials. The front door is flanked by stained glass sidelights and transom. Windows are one over one double-hung wood sash and are finished with a simple board A small shed addition is located on the east elevation. trim. Α deck/porch is located on the rear elevation. The house is sited above street level. A scored concrete retaining wall is located at street level and a rock retaining wall is located just north of the porch Shrubs and deciduous trees are scattered throughout the stairs. A natural basalt outcropping is south of the property. property. Alterations include a skylight on the east elevation, a metal sliding window and the installation of a green house window on the rear elevation, and a wrought-iron stair railing. In excellent condition, the building has minor alterations.

Historical Data: This property is known as Lot 6 in Block 4 of Trevitt's Addition. On August 31, 1868, Victor Trevitt sold Lots 4, 5 & 6 and other lots to Anna E. Craig for \$350 (Book D:159).

A portion of the present house was most likely built by the Craig family. The 1878 tax assessment for Anna E. Craig showed her still the owner of Lots 4, 5 & 6. On November 25, 1895, Charles Craig and Frank P. Craig, both heirs of Anna E. Craig, sold the property to Catherine A. Craig for \$1 (Book V:628). By April, 1902, ownership of the property had transferred to A. and Kate A. Floyd, no deed record was found. On April 25, 1902, A. and Kate A. Floyd sold the property to J. S. Fish for \$1,500 (Book 33:590). On June 25, 1907, J. S. and Ruth Fish sold the property to N. J. Sinnott, including Lots 5, 6 and part of 4. The house remained in the Sinnott family until it was sold by Dorothy Sinnott to Anne J. Bennett on July 16, 1945.

The 1888, 1892 and 1900 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map indicate a one and one-half story house with a one-story ell on the west elevation. By 1909, either a new house was constructed on the lot or the earlier house was substantially enlarged and rebuilt.

The following are brief biographical sketches of the historic owners of the house in chronological order according to the chain of title.

<u>Ann E. Craiq</u> (b. 1820) was born to Mr. and Mrs. Bulger at St. John, New Brunswick, Canada on February 6, 1820. She came to the U.S. with her

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 7 Page 73

parents when she was ten years old, and they resided in Boston. On her nineteenth birthday she married James Monroe, and traveled to New York City where James enlisted in the Seminole War. Ann went to Florida with James, and on Christmas Day, 1839, their son Richard was born. Six months later, James was killed by Native Americans. Ann sailed to Boston, worked as a nurse at College Point, New York, where she met Polhemus Craig. Polhemus was born in 1810 at Monmouth, New Jersey. They were married in 1844 at New York City (Oregon Historical Society, 30-4:384). Her husband Polhemus and she traveled with the 4th U.S. Infantry to The Dalles in 1852, following service in the Mexican War of Ann was an army nurse and was the first nurse to live in The 1845-46. Dalles. She attended many of the births of area children with Polhemus acting as her mid-wife. Her husband was associated with H. G. Waldron in the drug and notion store at 221 East 1st Street, the oldest building in The Dalles. Dr. Polhemus Craig attended his patients in the back of the store. The 1865 General Directory & Business Guide listed Polhemus as working in drugs and medicines on Main Street and living on Fourth Street (Owens, 1865). In 1880 Ann Craig was 60 years old and a widow. Two of her children lived with her, a daughter Katie-age 21 and a son Frankie-18 (1880 Census:37). The couple had twin sons, Charles and George born in 1856. They had a daughter Kate born in 1859 and a son Frank born in 1862. Polhemus had a brother, Charles Craig, a painter in The Dalles. Charles lived in the 300 block of West 4th Street (McNeal, 1975:55). Polhemus died on November 12, 1877 and was survived by Ann, Kate and Frank. Polhemus, Ann, and their children were buried in the family plot in the St. Peter's Cemetery (Mid-Columbia Genealogical Society, 1983:41).

Frank Polhemus Craiq (1862-1930) was born to Polhemus and Ann Craig on April 12, 1862 (Mid Columbia Genealogical Society, 1983:41). His father, Polhemus Craig, was born in 1810 in Monmouth, New Jersey and his mother, Ann, was born in 1820 in St. John, New Brunswick, Canada. His parents traveled with the 4th U.S. Infantry to The Dalles in 1849, following service in the Mexican War of 1845-46. Frank Polhemus Craig died on January 30, 1930 (Mid-Columbia Genealogical Society, 1983:41).

<u>Catherine A. Craiq</u> (1859-1938) was the daughter of Polhemus and Ann Craig. Her father, Polhemus Craig, was born in 1810 in Monmouth, New Jersey and her mother, Ann, was born in 1820 in St. John, New Brunswick, Canada. Her parents traveled with the 4th U.S. Infantry to The Dalles in 1849, following service in the Mexican War of 1845-46. Catherine "Katie" Craig married A. Floyd on July 4, 1897, and they went to live in La Grande (Drake, 1878:78) Her husband was a charter member of a branch of Catholic Knights of America, fraternal insurance (Drake, 1994:3). Catherine died in 1938, and was buried in St. Peter's Cemetery (Mid-Columbia Genealogical Society, 1983:46).

# National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section number 7 Page 74

<u>Judd S. Fish</u> was married Mary Margaret "Mollie", the daughter of N. B. Sinnott, who was born October 13, 1888. The couple had a son Harold and a daughter Genevieve. In 1897 Judd was managing the Umatilla House. Mollie Sinnott Fish died on December 13, 1903 (Lockley, 1928:VII,824-26). Judd was listed in the 1910 directory as working at The Dalles Businessmen's Association and living at 700 Case. The 1917 directory listed Judd as manager of Hotel Dalles where he lived. The 1925 directory listed Judd as manager of the Court Apartments where he lived with his second wife, Bertha (Polk's, 1910, 1917, 1925).

Nicholas J. Sinnott (1870-1929) was born on December 9, 1870, and was the son of "Colonel" N. B. and Bride Brass Sinnott (Mid-Columbia Genealogical Society, 1983:45). His father was an early settler in The Dalles and proprietor of the Umatilla House, an early Dalles hotel. Nicholas J. attended public schools and the Wasco Academy in The Dalles where he received instruction from Professor Gatch. Nicholas Matriculated in the Notre Dame University in Indiana, where he was class valedictorian in 1891 and 1892 and where he graduated in 1892 with a Bachelor of Arts. He returned to The Dalles and began his law studies in the office of Judge Alfred S. Bennett and was admitted to the bar at Pendleton, Oregon, in 1895. Nicholas and his brother Roger B. Sinnott, also a lawyer, began a partnership in law that lasted until their father's death in 1897. In 1900 Nicholas formed a partnership with Judge Bennett for 12 years until Nicholas was elected to congress from Oregon's second district. In 1901 he married Dora Purcell and the couple had six children: Dorothy, Margaret, Alfred, Gertrude, Nicholas B., and Florence. He served in congress as a member of the committee on irrigation and reclamation until March 31, 1928, when President Coolidge appointed him to be judge on the U.S. court of claims (Lockley, Nicholas J. was listed in the 1910 directory as 1928:VII,824-26). working at Bennett & Sinnott and living at 316 West 4th Street. The 1917 directory listed Nicholas as a U.S. Congressman, living with his wife Dora at 316 West 4th (Polk's, 1910, 1917). He served as a representative from the second congressional district from 1912 to 1928. As a representative he was largely responsible for the opening of federal reclamation projects in Vale and Owyhee, and the enlarging of the Klamath and Umatilla projects. He died on July 20, 1929, at his home in Washington, D.C. (Mid-Columbia Genealogical Society, 1983:45).

Auxiliary Building: Workshop c.1960 Non-Compatible/

/Non-Contributing

The one story building is rectangular in plan and has a gable roof. The building has corrugated tin cladding and a shed extension on the north elevation. The building is located southwest of the house.



## STAFF REPORT HISTORIC LANDMARKS REVIEW # 156-17

TO: The Dalles Historic Landmarks Commission

**FROM:** Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner

**HEARING DATE:** Wednesday, August 2, 2017

**ISSUE:** Restoration plans underway and planned for the historic Sinnott House which is located in the Trevitt's National Historic District include: construction of a new foundation; remove and replace siding with new custom smooth cement board with same reveal as original to house; restoration of existing original windows; removing non historic aluminum windows and patio slider and replace with period appropriate windows and door; paint exterior of house with historic palette colors and a complete restoration of the interior home.

## **SYNOPSIS:**

APPLICANT	MAB RMB, LLC
PROPERTY OWNER	MAB RMB, LLC
LOCATION	316 W. 4 <sup>th</sup> Street, The Dalles, OR 97058
ZONING	"CBC-1" – Central Business Commercial
EXISTING USE	Vacant
SURROUNDING USE	Commercial and Residential
HISTORIC STATUS	N/A

**NOTIFICATION:** Published advertisement in local newspaper; notification to property owners within 100 feet, SHPO.

**RECOMMENDATION:** Approval, with conditions, based on the following findings of fact.

**BACKGROUND:** The Bustos family purchased the historic Sinnott House which is located in the Trevitt's National Historic District. Their purchase included plans for a complete restoration of the home as the home had multiple modifications to the exterior over the years. The applicants were aware that the house was located in the historic district, but unfortunately they were misinformed as to the processes that were necessary with any exterior restoration. Staff was notified that the house restorations were underway and reached out to the new owners and they immediately responded and made plans to meet on-site to go over the plans. Restoration plans underway and planned include: construction of a new foundation; remove and replace siding with new custom smooth cement board with same reveal as original to house; restoration of existing original windows; removing non historic aluminum windows and patio slider and replace with period appropriate windows and door; paint exterior of house with historic palette colors and a complete restoration of the interior home.

**ANALYSIS:** The Historic Landmarks Commission is responsible for conducting hearings dealing with proposed alterations to historic buildings. City of The Dalles General Ordinance 94-1194 as well as General Ordinance 96-1207 establishing design guidelines for Historic Resources will serve as a tool to help the Commission make these decisions. The purpose of the Historic Landmarks Commission, the Historic Ordinance and the review criteria are to:

- Protect historic and cultural resources from destruction, inappropriate alteration, and incompatible adjacent development;
- Stabilize and improve property values in historic districts and citywide;
- Enhance the city's attractiveness to visitors and residents, and stimulate business, industry and tourism;
- Educate The Dalles' citizens and visitors concerning the city's heritage;
- Preserve the historic housing stock of The Dalles;
- Comply with The Dalles Comprehensive Plan.

### A. CITY OF THE DALLES GENERAL ORDINANCE 94-1194—AN ORDINANCE RELATING TO HISTORIC RESOURCES WITHIN THE CITY OF THE DALLES.

Section 7, Subsection A. Review Criteria:

"Secretary's Standards. Commission decisions shall be based on the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties." The following are pertinent standards from the "Guide".

1. "A property shall be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships".

**FINDING-A1:** This site will be used for residential purposes. The previous use at this site was a single family home. Criterion met.

2. "The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alterations to features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided."

**FINDING-A2:** The applicants have planned a complete restoration of the structure, both interior and exterior. The applicants stated that the exterior siding included various styles from T-111 to original. All siding was removed prior to the new property owners realizing that a review was necessary before the Historic Landmarks Commission. All remaining features will be replaced, if deteriorated beyond repair, and all repairs will be made to match the original house. The applicants will be using

historic photos ensuring that the structure's exterior will be brought back to its original glory. The applicant has plans to replace the removed siding with new cement board siding that was made to match the historic siding that was removed. The proposed siding is smooth and has the same reveal as the original siding shown in the historic photos. Criterion will be addressed as a condition of approval.

3. "Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken."

**FINDING-A3:** The applicant's restoration plans will follow historic photos. There are no plans of adding any conjectural or architectural features. Criterion met.

4. "Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved."

**FINDING-A4:** A small addition to the east rear of the home was added for a laundry room years ago. This addition will remain and be sided to match the house. This addition has not acquired historical significance, but is not proposed to be removed from the historic structure. Criterion met.

5. "Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved."

**FINDING-A5:** There are no plans for any distinctive features to be removed other than the siding that has been removed and the replacement of the non-historic windows. Criterion met.

6. "Deteriorating historical features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence."

**FINDING-A6:** The applicants plan for the complete restoration of the structure as well as an addition to the rear. All features will be replaced, if deteriorated beyond repair, and all repairs will be made to match the original house, with the exception of the siding material type. The applicants will be using historic photos to ensure that the structure's exterior is historically accurate. Criterion met.

7. "Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible."

**FINDING-A7:** There are no plans for any surface cleaning of the historic structure. If surface cleaning is necessary, it will be required to be cleaned using the gentlest means possible. This will be addressed as a condition of approval.

8. "Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken."

**FINDING-A8:** Only minor excavation was necessary for the foundation. No resources were found. Additional excavation will be addressed as a condition of approval.

9. "New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment."

**FINDING-A9:** As stated above, the small addition to the rear will remain. No additions are planned with this restoration project. The materials requested to be used for the exterior will look the same as the original siding, but will be made of cement board which is currently used in the home building industry. Cement board is known to be made with 90% inflammable materials.

10. "New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."

**FINDING-A10:** No additions are planned with this application. Criterion does not apply.

### B. CITY OF THE DALLES GENERAL ORDINANCE 96-1207—AN ORDINANCE AMENDING SECTION 10(A) OF GENERAL ORDINANCE 94-1194, ESTABLISHING DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR HISTORIC RESOURCES. Page 24 ~ *SIDING*

"The sense of cohesiveness and continuity of Trevitt's Addition derives in part from the consistent use of building materials in building facades: horizontal wood siding, brick, and stucco. New construction and rehabilitation should use materials that provide scale and relate to the historic residential character.

GUIDELINES:

- a. Wherever possible preserve, repair and protect existing materials (see page 2, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation).
- b. If necessary, siding should be replaced with in-kind materials (see page 2, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation).
- c. The use of materials appropriate to the building style is recommended.
- d. Be consistent with the original siding in terms of style and exposure.
- e. When replacing shingle siding it is recommended to use shingles with the same texture, exposure, pattern and to install with the same construction technique.
- *f.* In general all buildings should have wood siding that is painted.
- g. For new construction the use of stucco, brick and wood siding is recommended.
- h. The use of aluminum, vinyl and plywood siding is prohibited."

**FINDING-B4(a-h):** The applicants plan to restore the exterior to its near original state. The proposed siding is cement board that is both smooth and has the same reveal as the original house siding. The applicant is requesting that the commission approve the alternative siding with hopes of the siding proving the same look and also the added benefit of being a fire deterrent.

## Page 26 ~WINDOWS & DOORS

"Windows and doors serve in giving character to the American house. They provide proportion and scale to the elevation. In Trevitt's Addition windows are predominantly double-hung sash. Door styles vary throughout the neighborhood. New construction and rehabilitation should try and preserve the historic character of the windows and doors through proportion, scale, and rhythm. GUIDELINES:

- a. When dealing with historic windows and doors it is best to repair before replacing (see page 2, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation).
- b. Replacement of the original windows and doors is not recommended. However, when replacement is necessary the material, size, proportion, scale, and detail of the original should be matched in order to preserve the historic integrity.
- c. Original muntin configuration should be kept as it gives scale and proportion to the overall reading of the window.
- d. If no original material exists the use of historic photographs is recommended.
- e. The use of thermal shutters and shades is recommended for weatherization as it does not affect the original windows, providing a non-impacting solution.
- f. Interior storm windows are recommended.
- g. Weatherstripping and caulking should be checked regularly to ensure good weatherization.
- *h.* New construction should use double-hung, one over one, or two over two windows with simple flat trim.
- *i* The use of vinyl windows is not recommended.
- j. Reflective glass is prohibited."

**FINDING-B5(a-j):** The applicants are proposing to preserve the historic character of the windows and doors. There are no plans to replace any <u>original</u> windows or doors unless they are beyond repair. The non-historic windows and sliding door will be replaced with period appropriate windows/door. Criterion will be addressed as a condition of approval.

**CONCLUSIONS:** The Commission will need to decide if the materials proposed with this application will be permitted. If the Commission agrees that the cement board siding that is smooth and with the same reveal as the original is acceptable, staff would suggest conditions of approval to approve the application as submitted with the seven suggested conditions of approval listed below. If the Commission determines that original materials are necessary for the proposed restoration work, staff would recommend modifying the conditions of approval to include the requirement of wood siding.

The proposed restorations to the Sinnott House will help revitalize and bring the exterior look of the house to its near original state. The repairs and work on the house will allow the historic house, that is located in the Historic Trevitt's Addition, to continue use as a residence for many years to come. In all respects this application meets the standards of the Secretary of the Interior and the City of The Dalles General Ordinance No.94-1194, as well as General Ordinance No. 96-1207, with the following conditions:

## Suggested Conditions of Approval:

## **OPTION #1 – Cement Board Siding Allowed - COA's**

- 1. Work will be completed in substantial conformance to the pictures and proposals as submitted and reviewed.
- 2. Any archeological resources or materials that are discovered during excavation, the applicants will need to stop excavation and have the site professionally evaluated prior to continued excavation at the site.
- 3. The final color scheme for the home will need to be reviewed and approved by the Planning Department Director. The color scheme should be chosen from a historic palette and should vary from the surrounding properties.
- 4. The applicants will need to submit plans for a building permit to the local State Building Codes Department.

- 5. Cleaning of the historic structure will require the applicants to use the gentlest means possible. No harsh chemical or sandblasting will be allowed.
- 6. Windows and door replacements will be required to meet the historic design guidelines. The applicants will need to notify the Planning Department of any alteration of the approved plans.
- 7. The materials used for the addition will need to look like the original siding on the historic house. Utmost care will need to be taken with the siding installation to ensure that if removed in the future the essential integrity of the building would be unimpaired.

### **OPTION #2 – Wood Siding Required - COA's**

- 1. Work will be completed in substantial conformance to the pictures and proposals as submitted and reviewed with exception to the siding materials.
- 2. Any archeological resources or materials that are discovered during excavation, the applicants will need to stop excavation and have the site professionally evaluated prior to continued excavation at the site.
- 3. The final color scheme for the home will need to be reviewed and approved by the Planning Department Director. The color scheme should be chosen from a historic palette and should vary from the surrounding properties.
- 4. The applicants will need to submit plans for a building permit to the local State Building Codes Department.
- 5. Cleaning of the historic structure will require the applicants to use the gentlest means possible. No harsh chemical or sandblasting will be allowed.
- 6. Windows and door replacements will be required to meet the historic design guidelines. The applicants will need to notify the Planning Department of any alteration of the approved plans.
- 7. The materials used for the addition will need to look like the original siding on the historic house and the material be wood. Utmost care will need to be taken with the installation to ensure that if removed in the future the essential integrity of the building would be unimpaired.



CITY of THE DALLES 313 COURT STREET THE DALLES, OREGON 97058

> (541) 296-5481 ext. 1125 PLANNING DEPARTMENT

# HISTORIC LANDMARKS RESOLUTION NO. 146-17

Adopting The Dalles Historic Landmarks Commission Application #156-17 of MAB RMB,

**LLC**. This application is for a Historic Landmarks Commission hearing to gain approval to make exterior modifications to the historic Sinnott House that include: replacement of siding comprised of varying styles and materials, restoration of the remaining historic windows, replacement of aluminum non-historic windows with period appropriate windows, and repainting the house in a historic palette. The property is located at 316 W. 4th Street, The Dalles, Oregon and is further described as 1N 13E 3 BB 4600. Property is zoned "CBC-1" – Central Business Commercial and is located in Trevitts National Historic District.

- I. RECITALS:
  - A. The Historic Landmarks Commission of the City of The Dalles has, on August 2, 2017, conducted a public hearing to consider the above request.
  - B. A Staff report was presented, stating findings of fact and conclusions of law.
  - C. Staff Report #156-17 and the minutes of the August 2, 2017 hearing, upon approval, provide the basis for this resolution and are herein attached by reference.
- II. RESOLUTION: Now, therefore, be it FOUND, DETERMINED, and ORDERED by the Historic Landmarks Commission of the City of The Dalles as follows:
  - A. In all respects as set forth in Recitals, Part "I" of this resolution.
  - B. Historic Landmarks Review #156-17, MAB RMB, LLC, is *approved* with the following conditions:
    - 1. Work will be completed in substantial conformance to the pictures and proposals as submitted and reviewed.
    - 2. Any archeological resources or materials that are discovered during excavation, the applicants will need to stop excavation and have the site professionally evaluated prior to continued excavation at the site.
    - 3. The final color scheme for the home will need to be reviewed and approved by the Planning Department Director. The color scheme should be chosen from a historic palette and should vary from the surrounding properties.
    - 4. The applicants will need to submit plans for a building permit to the local State Building Codes Department.
    - 5. Cleaning of the historic structure will require the applicants to use the gentlest means possible. No harsh chemical or sandblasting will be allowed.

- 6. Windows and door replacements will be required to meet the historic design guidelines. The applicants will need to notify the Planning Department of any alteration of the approved plans.
- 7. The materials used for the addition will need to look like the original siding on the historic house. Utmost care will need to be taken with the siding installation to ensure that if removed in the future the essential integrity of the building would be unimpaired.

## III. APPEALS, COMPLIANCE AND PENALTIES:

- A. Any party of record may appeal a decision of the Historic Landmarks Commission to the City Council for review. Appeals must be made in accordance to Section 9(a) of the Historic Landmarks Ordinance No. 1194, and must be filed with the City Clerk within ten (10) days of the date of mailing of this Order.
- B. Failure to exercise this approval within the time line set either by Order or by Ordinance will invalidate this permit.

ADOPTED THIS 2<sup>ND</sup> DAY, AUGUST 2017.

Eric Gleason, Chair Historic Landmarks Commission

I, Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner & Historic Landmarks Secretary for the Planning Department of the City of the Dalles, hereby certify that the foregoing Order was adopted at the meeting of the City Historic Landmarks Commission, held on August 2, 2017.

AYES:

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

ATTEST:

Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner & Historic Landmarks Commission Secretary City of The Dalles Planning Department



CITY of THE DALLES 313 COURT STREET THE DALLES, OREGON 97058

> (541) 296-5481 ext. 1125 PLANNING DEPARTMENT

# HISTORIC LANDMARKS RESOLUTION NO. 146-17

Adopting The Dalles Historic Landmarks Commission Application #156-17 of MAB RMB,

**LLC**. This application is for a Historic Landmarks Commission hearing to gain approval to make exterior modifications to the historic Sinnott House that include: replacement of siding comprised of varying styles and materials, restoration of the remaining historic windows, replacement of aluminum non-historic windows with period appropriate windows, and repainting the house in a historic palette. The property is located at 316 W. 4th Street, The Dalles, Oregon and is further described as 1N 13E 3 BB 4600. Property is zoned "CBC-1" – Central Business Commercial and is located in Trevitts National Historic District.

- I. RECITALS:
  - A. The Historic Landmarks Commission of the City of The Dalles has, on August 2, 2017, conducted a public hearing to consider the above request.
  - B. A Staff report was presented, stating findings of fact and conclusions of law.
  - C. Staff Report #156-17 and the minutes of the August 2, 2017 hearing, upon approval, provide the basis for this resolution and are herein attached by reference.
- II. RESOLUTION: Now, therefore, be it FOUND, DETERMINED, and ORDERED by the Historic Landmarks Commission of the City of The Dalles as follows:
  - A. In all respects as set forth in Recitals, Part "I" of this resolution.
  - B. Historic Landmarks Review #156-17, MAB RMB, LLC, is *approved* with the following conditions:
    - 1. Work will be completed in substantial conformance to the pictures and proposals as submitted and reviewed with exception to the siding materials.
    - 2. Any archeological resources or materials that are discovered during excavation, the applicants will need to stop excavation and have the site professionally evaluated prior to continued excavation at the site.
    - 3. The final color scheme for the home will need to be reviewed and approved by the Planning Department Director. The color scheme should be chosen from a historic palette and should vary from the surrounding properties.
    - 4. The applicants will need to submit plans for a building permit to the local State Building Codes Department.
    - 5. Cleaning of the historic structure will require the applicants to use the gentlest means possible. No harsh chemical or sandblasting will be allowed.

- 6. Windows and door replacements will be required to meet the historic design guidelines. The applicants will need to notify the Planning Department of any alteration of the approved plans.
- 7. The materials used for the addition will need to look like the original siding on the historic house and the material be wood. Utmost care will need to be taken with the installation to ensure that if removed in the future the essential integrity of the building would be unimpaired.

## III. APPEALS, COMPLIANCE AND PENALTIES:

- A. Any party of record may appeal a decision of the Historic Landmarks Commission to the City Council for review. Appeals must be made in accordance to Section 9(a) of the Historic Landmarks Ordinance No. 1194, and must be filed with the City Clerk within ten (10) days of the date of mailing of this Order.
- B. Failure to exercise this approval within the time line set either by Order or by Ordinance will invalidate this permit.

ADOPTED THIS 2<sup>ND</sup> DAY, AUGUST 2017.

Eric Gleason, Chair Historic Landmarks Commission

I, Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner & Historic Landmarks Secretary for the Planning Department of the City of the Dalles, hereby certify that the foregoing Order was adopted at the meeting of the City Historic Landmarks Commission, held on August 2, 2017.

AYES:

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

ATTEST:

Dawn Marie Hert, Senior Planner & Historic Landmarks Commission Secretary City of The Dalles Planning Department