

DEQ Art Glass Permanent Rule

Fiscal Impact Estimate for proposed rule- Tier 2 CAGM

Tier 2 (Bullseye and Uroboros)		
Requirements summary	Install control device on all furnaces using metal HAPs If using chrome: Source test & modeling to develop daily & annual max usage Then follow the max usage limits	
	Cost Estimate	
	low	high

Permitting costs

NESHAP 6S applies?	Y		
Needs Title V permit because of 6S?	Y		
Cost of Title V application (including DEQ fees + consultant to prepare	\$25,000	\$100,000	If a facility needs a Title V due to NESHAP 6S, that is independent of this art glass rule, so this cost isn't included in the totals.
Incremental extra cost of Title V application due to art glass rule	\$0	\$5,000	
Annual DEQ Title V permit costs	\$10,310	\$11,510	If a facility needs a Title V due to NESHAP 6S, that is independent of this art glass rule, so this cost isn't included in the totals.

Control Device Costs

install baghouse	\$250,000	\$300,000	Assume install of 1 additional baghouse, above what would have been installed due to NESHAP 6S. electricity, bag replacement etc
annual operation	\$15,000	\$70,000	

Reporting Costs

Annual cost to monitor and report on baghouse to DEQ	\$12,000	\$12,000
--	----------	----------

Source Testing Costs

One-time source test to measure Cr6 emissions when making products containing Cr3 or Cr6	\$60,000	\$65,000	Assume this requires 16 hr runs. At some facilities, may be able to run concurrently with 99% control efficiency test, reducing cost. \$10-15k if test can be done in 1-3 hr runs. If 16hr runs, \$65k. If 4-day runs, \$100k.
One-time source test to demonstrate 99% PM control efficiency	\$4,000	\$15,000	

Modeling Costs

One-time modeling to find max production rate that results in acceptable source impact level		
AERSCREEN model only	\$10,000	-
AERSCREEN followed by AERMOD model	-	\$30,000

Total Costs

one-time costs	\$324,000	\$415,000
annual costs	\$27,000	\$82,000

DEQ Art Glass Permanent Rule
Fiscal Impact Estimate for proposed rule- Tier 1 CAGM

Tier 1 (Northstar, Trautman and Glass Alchemy)						
Requirements summary	Do 1 of these at all furnaces: Install control device Source test & modeling to show impact below limits Request permit condition to not use metal HAPs					
	Cost Estimate					
	If doing source test and modeling only		If installing control device		If taking permit condition to stop using metal HAPs	
	low	high	low	high	low	high

Permitting costs

NESHAP 6S applies?	N		N		N	
Rule would require facility to get new permit	Yes, ACDP		Yes, ACDP		Yes, ACDP	
Application Fee	\$ 7,200	\$ 7,200	\$ 7,200	\$ 7,200	\$ 7,200	\$ 7,200
Consultant to prepare application	-	-	-	-	-	-
Annual Permit Fee (applies at time of application and each year after)	\$ 4,608	\$ 4,608	\$ 4,608	\$ 4,608	\$ 4,608	\$ 4,608

Control Device Costs

install baghouse	-	-	\$250,000	\$300,000	-	-	electricity, bag replacement etc
annual operation	-	-	\$15,000	\$70,000	-	-	

Reporting Costs

Annual cost to monitor and report on baghouse to DEQ	-	-	\$12,000	\$12,000	-	-
--	---	---	----------	----------	---	---

Source Testing Costs

One-time source test to measure metal emissions including total Cr. (Total Cr can be used as a proxy for Cr6)	\$15,000	\$25,000					
One-time source test to measure Cr6 emissions when making products containing Cr3 (optional)	\$0	\$65,000	If Tier 1 and using control device, don't have to test for Cr6.		-	-	test length depends on detection limits
One-time source test to demonstrate 99% PM control efficiency	-	-	\$4,000	\$15,000	-	-	

Modeling Costs

One-time modeling to find max production rate that results in acceptable source impact level						
AERSCREEN model only	\$10,000	-	-	-	-	-
AERSCREEN followed by AERMOD model	-	\$30,000	-	-	-	-

Cost of reduced production

stopping production of materials containing Cr6 (required to take source test + modeling exemption)	unknown	unknown	-	-	About 1/2 of products contain metal HAPs. There may not be workable substitute formulations. Facilities may choose to phase out one or a few metal HAPs but are likely to choose source test & modeling or installation of a control device.	
reduced production if source testing shows it's needed to meet receptor conc limits	unknown	unknown	-	-		

Total Costs

one-time costs	\$17,200	\$102,200	\$261,200	\$322,200	\$7,200	\$7,200
annual costs	\$4,608	\$4,608	\$31,608	\$86,608	50% of facility profit (?)	